

Minutes of the meeting of Committee for Technical Evaluation for appointment of Creative Agency for Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion(DIPP)

1. The Meeting of the Committee for Technical Evaluation for appointment of Creative Agency for Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion(DIPP) was held at 3:00 PM on 18th June, 2015 in room no. 152, Udyog Bhawan, New Delhi.
2. The Committee took note of the scope of work mentioned in Section 5, minimum qualification criteria stated under para 2.6.4 and the technical evaluation criteria given in para 2.6.5 of the RFQ-cum-RFP issued by DIPP for appointment of Creative Agency.
3. The Committee further took on record the minutes of opening of EMD and examination of prequalification documents for this RFQ-cum-RFP placed before the Committee under signature of Director (BE-III) (Annexure-A) with reference to minimum qualification criteria under para 2.6.4 of Section 2 of RfQ-cum-RfP. After due consideration of records as mentioned at Annexure-A, the Evaluation Committee decided to qualify the following bidders meeting the minimum qualification criteria:
 - a. M/s. Goldmine Advertising Limited
 - b. M/s. Wieden+Kennedy India Pvt. Ltd.
 - c. M/s. Span Communications
 - d. M/s. RK Swamy BBDO
 - e. M/s. Promodome Communications Pvt. Ltd.
4. The Committee accordingly decided to proceed with the technical evaluation of the above mentioned five bidders and took note of the documents submitted by each of the five bidders as per the statement prepared by US (BE-III) and enclosed at Annexure-B and examined all these documents in detail. The Committee noted that the firm M/s Promodome Communications Pvt. Ltd. had not provided any details required to be submitted for technical evaluation in prescribed format and instead submitted blank forms. In absence of details required for technical evaluation, the Committee decided to not technically evaluate M/s. Promodome Communications Pvt. Ltd. The Committee further noted that there was no representative of M/s. Promodome Communications Pvt. Ltd. present for technical presentation even after written intimation to them to be present.
5. The Committee accordingly decided to proceed with the presentation by the following four qualified bidders as per the technical evaluation criteria laid down in para 2.6.5 of Section 2 of RFQ-cum-RFP. The attendance sheet of the representatives of four bidders, who made presentation before the Committee is enclosed at Annexure-C.
 - a. M/s. Goldmine Advertising Limited
 - b. M/s. Wieden+Kennedy India Pvt. Ltd.
 - c. M/s. Span Communications
 - d. M/s. RK Swamy BBDO
6. The presentations were made by each of the four bidders. Each of the bidders was asked to make presentation with regard to each of the component prescribed for



technical evaluation as per para 2.6.5 of RfQ-cum-RfP. Each of the bidders was asked specifically about creative vision and strategy envisaged for DIPP's creative campaign, profile and track record of the agency, award winning campaigns handled, creative output based on previous work undertaken, website development, credentials of creative team identified to work with DIPP, proposed experiential design and outreach programme. The entire analysis was done with the objective of shortlisting agencies who could deliver world class creatives for 'Make in India' campaign. After every presentation made by the bidder firms, the committee members deliberated at length with regard to various components covered by the firms as per the evaluation criteria specified in RfQ-cum-RfP, before awarding the final marks to each bidder. The details of marks unanimously agreed by all committee members are attached at Annexure-D.


7. The technical score obtained by the four bidders are as follows:

a. M/s. Goldmine Advertising Limited	45
b. M/s. Wieden+Kennedy India Pvt. Ltd.	90
c. M/s. Span Communications	42
d. M/s. RK Swamy BBDO	65

8. Based on the technical evaluation, the following two bidders were found qualified and were recommended for opening of their financial bid:


a. M/s. Wieden+Kennedy India Pvt. Ltd.	90
b. M/s. RK Swamy BBDO	65

10. The date for opening the financial bid of above mentioned two bidders was fixed on 20th June, 2015 at 11:30 AM and it was directed to inform the above said two bidders to be present at the time of financial bid opening.


(Meenakshi Mehta)
DDG, M/o Tourism
(Member)


(Gauri Karol)
Director (Finance)
DIPP
(Member)


(Atul Chaturvedi)
Joint Secretary, DIPP
(Member)


(Sunit Tandon)
Director General, IIMC
(Chairman)

RFQ-cum-RFP for appointment of Creative Agency Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion

Minutes of opening of EMD and examination of pre-qualification documents

Venue: Udyog Bhawan

Date and time: 12th June, 2015 (3:00 PM)

Attendance Sheet

S.No.	Name (S/Shri/Ms.)	Company/Designation	Phone/Mobile No.
1.	D.N. Joshi	Under Secretary, DIPP	23061592
2.	Sumeet Chawla	Assistant, BE-III Section	
3.	Raj Singh	Concept Communications Ltd.	9953558299
4.	Rashmi	RK Swamy BBDO Pvt. Ltd.	8860601223
5.	Unnikrishnan	-do-	9350657367

2. The time for opening the bid for the appointment of Creative Agency for Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion (DIPP) was fixed at 3:00 PM on 12th June, 2015. After verifying that no other representative of any other bidder is present, process of bid opening was started.

3. Bids were decrypted on the Central Public Procurement Portal and copies of EMD documents were downloaded. The EMD documents received in original offline were opened and matched with the copy of EMD on the portal. All EMDs were found in order as detailed below:

S.No.	Company	EMD details
1.	Wieden+Kennedy India Pvt. Ltd.	DD No. 046774 of HSBC Bank dt.8.6.2015
2.	Span Communications	BG No.6019IPEBG150063 of Bank of India, Lajpat Nagar, Delhi dt.10.6.2015
3.	RK Swamy BBDO	BG No. 004GT02151600001 of HDFC Bank, Chennai dt.9.6.2015
4.	Goldmine Advertising Limited	Exemption from EMD as per certificate of MSME submitted.
5.	Promodome Communications Pvt. Ltd.	DD No. 276784 of Yes Bank dt.10.6.2015

4. Accordingly the Pre-qualification documents of the applicants were downloaded.

5. According to Section 2, para 2.6.4 of RFQ-cum-RFP, following conditions were kept for pre-qualification:

I. The Creative Agency must have been in operation for a minimum of **3 years**, as on 31st March 2015, in designing/production of creatives/commercials for various media, including print, TV, ,

online, outdoor, etc., as well as publicity material including brochures, posters, etc., (supporting documents to be submitted).


II. The Creative Agency must have a cumulative revenue from creative work of **Rs. 10 crore** and above in the last three financial years (2012-13, 2013-14 & 2014-15). (A certificate from Chartered Accountant should be submitted).

III. The Creative Agency should have handled at least one creative account in any sector, with revenue of over **Rs. 1 crore**, in any one of the last three years. (A certificate from Chartered Accountant should be submitted).

6. All the bids received were examined with reference to the pre-qualification criteria laid down in RfQ-cum-RfP for this purpose as under:

S. No.	Criteria as per Section 2, para 2.6.4 of RFQ-CUM-RFP.	Name of the bidder firms and status of fulfilling Pre Qualification				
		Wieden+ Kennedy India Pvt. Ltd.	Span Communication s	RK Swamy BBDO	Goldmine Advertising Limited	Promodome Communications Pvt. Ltd.
1.	The Creative Agency must have been in operation for a minimum of 3 years , as on 31 st March 2015, in designing/production of creatives/commercials for various media, including print, TV, online, outdoor, etc., as well as publicity material including brochures, posters, etc., (supporting documents to be submitted). (Form 3B)	Yes Self certified	Yes Self certified	Yes RoC certificate	Yes RoC certificate	Yes Self certified
2.	The Creative Agency must have a cumulative revenue from creative work of Rs. 10 crore and above in the last	Yes CA certificate	Yes CA certificate	Yes CA certificate	Yes CA certificate	Yes CA certificate (total of three years coming to

	three financial years (2012-13, 2013-14 & 2014-15). (A certificate from Chartered Accountant should be submitted). (Form 3C)					Rs.18.99 but indicated as 6.33 as cumulative)
3.	The Creative Agency should have handled at least one creative account in any sector, with revenue of over Rs. 1 crore , in any one of the last three years. (A certificate from Chartered Accountant should be submitted). (Form 3C)	Yes CA certificate	Yes CA certificate	Yes CA certificate	Yes CA certificate	Yes CA certificate


 12/6/2015
 (D.E. Richards)
 Director (BE-III)

**Check list of documents submitted by the bidders with regard to
para 2.6.5 of the RfQ-cum-RfP for selection of creative agency for DIPP**

Evaluation Criteria	Document	Goldmine Advertising Limited	Wieden+Kennedy India Pvt. Ltd.	Span Communications	RK Swamy BBDO	Promodome Communications Pvt. Ltd.
Creative vision and strategy presented for DIPP's creative campaign <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understanding of components of country investment promotion campaigns • Study and analysis of international campaigns for investment promotion followed by IPAs globally • Strategies for specific sectors and geographies 	Form 3G	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (Information given but form no. not mentioned)	Blank Form submitted
Profile and track record of the agency, including experience of the agency in the creative field, campaigns/brands handled, above/below the line activities undertaken <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Profile of the agency including number of years' experience • Campaigns/brands handled • Global campaigns handled 	Form 3H	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (Information given but form no. not mentioned)	Blank Form submitted
Award-winning campaigns handled, if any	Form 3I	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (Information given but form no. not mentioned)	Blank Form submitted

Creative output based on previous work undertaken and sample creative material submitted with the Technical Proposal • Design for brochure	Form 3J	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (Information given but form no. not mentioned)	Blank Form submitted
Creative output based on previous work undertaken and sample video animation material submitted with the Technical Proposal • Concept and story board for a video animation • Examples of video animation campaigns	Form 3K Form 3L	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (Information given but form no. not mentioned)	Blank Form submitted
Website development • Up gradation and improvement plan for website • Concept for development of dynamic content for website	Form 3M	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Blank Form submitted
Credentials of creative team identified to work with DIPP	Form 3N	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (Information given but form no. not mentioned)	Blank Form submitted
Experiential Design	Form 3O	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (Information given but form no. not mentioned)	Blank Form submitted
Outreach programme	Form 3P	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Blank Form submitted


17.6.15

D.N. JOSHI
US(BE-111)

RFO-cum-RFP for appointment of Creative Agency for DIPP.

Annexure -D

Technical Evaluation of bids

S. No.	Evaluation Criteria	Max. Points/ Marks	Document	Goldmine Advertising Limited	Wieden+Kendy India Pvt. Ltd.	Span Communications	RK Swamy BBDO
A	Creative vision and strategy presented for DIPP's creative campaign <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Understanding of components of country investment promotion campaigns Study and analysis of international campaigns for investment promotion followed by IPAs globally Strategies for specific sectors and geographies 	20	Form 3G	9	19	8	12
B	Profile and track record of the agency, including experience of the agency in the creative field, campaigns/brands handled, above/below the line activities undertaken <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Profile of the agency including number of years' experience Campaigns/brands handled Global campaigns handled 	25	Form 3H	15	23	14	21
C	Award-winning campaigns handled, if any	5	Form 3I	2	2	2	4
D	Creative output based on previous work undertaken and sample creative material submitted with the Technical Proposal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Design for brochure 	15	Form 3J	7	14	6	10
E	Creative output based on previous work undertaken and sample video animation material submitted with the Technical Proposal <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Concept and story board for a video animation Examples of video animation campaigns 	5	Form 3K Form 3L	2	5	2	2


Sum

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

F	Website development • Up gradation and improvement plan for website • Concept for development of dynamic content for website	5	Form 3M	2	4	2	3
G	Credentials of creative team identified to work with DIPP	10	Form 3N	4	9	4	7
H	Experiential Design	5	Form 3O	2	5	2	2
I	Outreach programme	10	Form 3P	2	9	2	4
	Total	100	--	45	90	42	65


(Meenakshi Mehta)
Dy. Director General,
M/o Tourism
(Member)


(Gauri Karol)
Director(Finance), DIPP
(Member)


(Atul Chaturvedi)
Joint Secretary,
DIPP
(Member)


(Sunit Tandon)
Director General, IMC
(Chairman)